李漵的五松圖

莊素娥

松是萬木之長，古代畫山水者必畫松。歷代以松作主的畫題中常見的有「雙松」、「三松」、「五松」等。郭熙《林泉高致》記：「松有雙松三松，五松六松，怪木古木，老木垂崖，怪木巖崎，古木喬松，至一 бесплат，皆有壽用，壽松長松。」(1)可知，「松」為「長壽」的象徵，故畫家多喜畫之。「五松圖」中的五松，也常被認為是五大夫的象徵。此種說法的源流甚早。（史記）〈秦始皇本紀第六〉記有：

二十有八年，始皇東行郡縣，上鄭山。立石，與耆老諸生議，曰石頭泰德，議封禪望祭山川之事。乃遂上泰山。立石，封，祠祀，下，風雨暴至，休於樹下，因封其樹為五大夫。歸梁父，則所立石。

由此可知，「五松」被冠上「五大夫」的原因。現在泰山仍有「五松亭」的存在，據說是秦始皇當初封五松之所在。五大夫爲爵位名，秦漢時分爵位爲公士、上造等二十級，其中大夫居第五級，又有官大夫、公大夫、五大夫等名目。（2）李漵曾畫有「五松圖」，其原意是意味著五大夫，或爲祝壽之用？由「五松圖」題款最後一句「懸之君家桂堂東，俯視百廣兒女囊」看來，它應是作爲祝壽之用。李漵的老師蔣廷錫也曾畫有「五松圖」，李玉棻《甕牖編室書畫過目考》於「蔣廷錫」條下記有：

曾見葉逢詩裏有淡墨色樹竹於山圖卷，額額南田。又墨筆五松圖絹本大冊。（3）

故知，李漵畫「五松圖」可能是受師薰陶所致。可惜，蔣廷錫的「五松圖」已不知去向，無法將李漵的「五松圖」和它作一比較。目前筆者所知李漵的「五松圖」最少已有十九張之多，其分別爲：

(1)北京故宮博物院藏，無紀年，軸。（圖一）
(2)南京市博物館藏，無紀年，軸。（圖二）
(3)南京博物院藏，無紀年，紙本，軸，水墨，291.5×133.5cm（圖三）
(4)日本東京博物館藏，無紀年，絹本，軸，設色，200.2×94.7cm（圖四）
(5)南京博物院藏，1735，紙本，軸，水墨，359.2×140cm（圖五）
(6)無錫市博物館藏，1735，紙本，冊頁，設色，23.8×29.2cm（圖六）
(7)美國 Dr. James Cahill 敛，1735，紙本，冊頁，水墨，23.4×29cm（圖七）
(8)美國 Cleveland Museum of Art 收，1747，紙本，軸，水墨，199.4×94cm（圖八）
(9)揚州市文物商店藏，1747，紙本，軸，水墨，221×110.5cm（圖九）
(10)上海博物館藏，1753，紙本，軸，水墨，228.5×117.8cm（圖十）
Li Shan's "Five Pine Trees"

Su-o Chuang

Through the research of art historians in recent years, a number of forgeries have been discovered among the paintings of the "Eight Eccentrics of Yang-chou." Even during the lifetime of Li Shan, one of the "Eight Eccentrics" who achieved fame at an early age, it was known that numerous forgeries of his work were made by his contemporaries. In the last fifteen years a large number of Li Shan's paintings of "Five Pine Trees" have been made available for exhibition from various sources, including private collections and museums in China, Japan, and the United States. At least nineteen paintings of Li Shan's "Five Pine Trees," and three pieces of calligraphy which bear the exact same content as the inscriptions on these paintings, are now known to exist. Not all of these works are genuine, however. This paper will focus on picking out the forgeries among these works through a careful study. Due to the difficulty of obtaining photos, only ten paintings and two examples of calligraphy of the "Five Pine Trees" have been chosen to be discussed here for their authenticity.

In the inscription on "Five Pine Trees", Li Shan indicates that he intended to paint five pine trees in diverse shapes: a straight pine, a bold pine, a leaning pine, a reclining pine, and a round pine. Furthermore, he personified the straight pine as a statesman, the bold pine as a famous general, the leaning and reclining pines as dragons, and the short round pine with needles like a grass mat as either an immortal or a Buddha. However, an examination of the images of the five pines in these ten pictures shows that only six are in accord with what Li's inscription describes. Further study of the arrangement and perspective of the pine trunks and the structure of the branches of the trees reveals that three of these pictures are obviously illogical depictions. An analysis of the stylistic expression of the brush strokes of these paintings and pieces of calligraphy also indicate that only four of the paintings and three inscriptions are Li Shan's own brushwork. Upon investigation of the content of the "Five Pines" poem of the inscriptions and calligraphy, many of the pieces show defects which reveal their lack of authenticity.

The conclusion of these detailed examinations is that only three paintings of "Five Pine Trees" deserve to be called Li Shan's genuine work.